Original: English

# EXPLANATORY NOTE FOR A DRAFT RECOMMENDATION BY ICCAT TO ESTABLISH A REBUILDING PROGRAM FOR NORTH ATLANTIC SHORTFIN MAKO SHARKS CAUGHT IN ASSOCIATION WITH ICCAT FISHERIES

(Submitted by the United States and Curação)

The 2017 stock assessment for North Atlantic shortfin make shark found a 90% probability of the stock being overfished and experiencing overfishing. In response, the Commission adopted Recommendation 17-08, which contained measures designed to stop overfishing and begin to rebuild the stock. In 2019, the SCRS carried out new projections for the stock through 2070 (two mean generation times) at the Commission's request and produced a Kobe II Strategy Matrix. Due to the biology of this species, a significant lag time can be expected between when a TAC is implemented and when the spawning stock biomass begins to increase. To accelerate the rate of recovery and to increase the probability of success, the SCRS recommends that the Commission adopt a non-retention policy without exception in the North Atlantic. However, due to at-vessel and post-release mortality, a simple no-retention requirement is not expected to reduce mortality enough to stop overfishing and rebuild the stock. Additional efforts are needed focused on the needed mortality reductions; the SCRS has suggested that gear modifications and time/area closures along with safe handling and release practices have the potential to further reduce mortality and support rebuilding.

Taking all of this into account, the U.S. proposal focuses on needed mortality reductions to end overfishing immediately and would establish a rebuilding program for North Atlantic shortfin make stock with a greater than 50% probability. Given the extent of catch reductions needed and the resulting adjustments that will be needed in the fisheries, the plan is implemented in two phases, with the second phase focused on rebuilding biomass to levels that support MSY by 2070, a timeframe that takes into account the biology of the stock. To end overfishing, the proposal establishes an annual total allowable catch (TAC) of 700 t in 2020, with a reduction over the next two years to a TAC level of no more than 500 t by 2022. To achieve these reductions, the proposal requires that each CPC take measures so that its annual catch of North Atlantic shortfin make is reduced in 2020 by at least 80% from the average of the CPC's 2013-2015 levels and, by 2022, by at least 85% from those same levels. The 2013-2015 catch level represents the last three years of catches included in the 2017 stock assessment. Average total North Atlantic shortfin make catches in 2013-2015 were 3,137 t; an 80% reduction from this level would be 627 t (in line with reducing catches to within a 700 t TAC) and an 85% reduction would be 471 t (in line with reducing catches to within a 500 t TAC).

The retention of North Atlantic shortfin mako sharks generally is prohibited in this proposal. However, provided that a CPC has achieved the reductions in catches as required, that CPC may authorize its vessels to retain shortfin mako under very limited circumstances -- specifically, if the shark is dead at haulback and the vessel has an observer or electronic monitoring system on board to verify the condition of the shark; or a CPC requires a minimum size of at least 180 cm fork length for males and of at least 210 cm fork length for females; or a CPC prohibits North Atlantic shortfin mako fisheries and requires that all dead fish be landed and that the fishermen shall not draw any profit from such fish.

The proposal includes a requirement that longline vessels use nylon monofilament leaders and large circle hooks. In 2017, the SCRS noted that the use of monofilament instead of steel traces or wire leaders is known to be effective at reducing shark bycatch in longline fisheries. In addition, a number of studies presented at tuna RFMO meetings have concluded that shark catch rates on longline gear, including shortfin make shark catch rates, are lower on monofilament leaders compared to wire leaders. These studies further conclude that the use of monofilament leaders is an effective method for reducing shark bycatch and mitigating shark mortality in longline fisheries. In 2019, the SCRS noted that, although catch rates using circle hooks were reported in some studies to be higher for sharks, this could be due to fewer bite-offs than with J-hooks. (J-hooks tend to result more often in deep hooking (e.g., in the gut) making bite-offs more likely to occur.) The SCRS further noted that, with regard to shortfin make, studies have shown that when using circle hooks, the retention rate would increase but at-haulback mortality would decrease compared to J-hooks.

The SCRS has reemphasized that CPCs will need to strengthen their monitoring and data collection efforts to support future stock assessments, including but not limited to total extrapolated dead discards and the estimation of CPUE using observer data. This proposal would require CPCs to report their number of dead discards and live releases of North Atlantic shortfin mako, estimated based on the total fishing effort of their relevant fleets, using data collected through observer programs or other relevant data collection programs. The SCRS also noted that time/area closures have the potential to reduce shortfin mako mortality. The U.S. proposal requires that, in 2022, the SCRS will advise the Commission on areas with high shortfin mako interactions and areas that are biologically important (e.g., pupping grounds) for potential future time/area management, and also provide updated information on growth and size at maturity. At that time, the rebuilding program will be reviewed with an aim to incorporate any new advice from the SCRS about gear modifications, time/area closures, or other measures that could further support the rebuilding of this stock.

# DRAFT RECOMMENDATION BY ICCAT TO ESTABLISH A REBUILDING PROGRAM FOR NORTH ATLANTIC SHORTFIN MAKO SHARKS CAUGHT IN ASSOCIATION WITH ICCAT FISHERIES

(Proposal by the United States and Curação)

*RECOGNIZING* that shortfin make sharks are primarily caught in association with ICCAT fisheries and that the Commission has adopted management measures for shark species considered vulnerable to overfishing in ICCAT fisheries;

*NOTING* that the 2017 stock assessment found that there is a 90% probability of the North Atlantic shortfin make stock being overfished and experiencing overfishing;

RECALLING measures adopted by the Commission to improve the status of shortfin make sharks, including the Recommendation by ICCAT on the Conservation of North Atlantic Stock of Shortfin Make Caught in Association with ICCAT Fisheries [Rec. 17-08], which implemented measures aimed at ending overfishing of the North Atlantic shortfin make stock with a high probability, as the first step in the development of a rebuilding program;

CONSIDERING that the Recommendation by ICCAT on the Principles of Decision Making for ICCAT Conservation and Management Measures (Rec. 11-13) calls for the Commission to immediately adopt management measures designed to result in a high probability of ending overfishing in as short a period as possible and adopt a plan to rebuild the stock taking into account, *inter alia*, the biology of the stock and SCRS advice;

FURTHER NOTING that the Kobe II Strategy Matrix produced by the SCRS during a stock assessment update in 2019 indicates that a TAC of 700 t has a 69% probability of ending overfishing in 2020, while a TAC of 500 t has a 52% probability of rebuilding the stock by 2070;

*ACKNOWLEDGING* the need to establish an effective rebuilding program for North Atlantic shortfin make, including immediate action to reduce fishing mortality to end overfishing;

*UNDERSTANDING* that the SCRS has further advised that to accelerate the rate of recovery and to increase the probability of success in rebuilding the stock, the Commission adopt a non-retention policy without exception;

KEENLY AWARE, however, that a reduction in incidental mortality, including dead discards, beyond what could be expected from a no retention policy, is needed to increase the probability of successfully rebuilding North Atlantic shortfin make shark;

ALSO RECOGNIZING SCRS advice on the need for Contracting Parties and Cooperating non-Contracting Parties, Entities, or Fishing Entities (hereinafter referred to as CPCs) to strengthen their monitoring and data collection efforts in support of future stock assessments, including but not limited to total estimated dead discards and the estimation of CPUE using observer data;

*RESPONDING* to the need for additional efforts to reduce the at-vessel mortality and increase post-release survivability of shortfin make sharks that are incidentally hooked; and

*FURTHER RESPONDING* to the need for additional research on methods to reduce shortfin make interactions in ICCAT fisheries, including identifying areas with high interactions;

THE INTERNATIONAL COMMISSION FOR THE CONSERVATION OF ATLANTIC TUNAS (ICCAT) RECOMMENDS THAT:

- 1. A rebuilding program shall be implemented to end overfishing immediately and rebuild North Atlantic shortfin make (*Isurus oxyrinchus*) to biomass levels sufficient to support maximum sustainable yield (MSY) by 2070, a time frame which takes into account the biology of the stock. The provisions of this Recommendation apply to North Atlantic shortfin make sharks caught in association with ICCAT fisheries.
- 2. CPCs shall implement measures for North Atlantic shortfin make to end overfishing and support rebuilding through an annual total allowable catch (TAC) of 700 t in 2020 with a reduction over the next two years to a TAC level of no more than 500 t by 2022.
- 3. In order to achieve the reductions in total mortality established in paragraph 2, each CPC shall take measures so that its annual catch of North Atlantic shortfin make is reduced as follows:
  - in 2020, by at least 80% from the average of the CPC's 2013-2015 levels, as reflected in the 2019 SCRS report, and,
  - by 2022, by at least 85% from those 2013-2015 levels.
- 4. CPCs shall require vessels flying their flag to promptly release North Atlantic shortfin make in a manner that causes the least harm to the shark, while giving due consideration to the safety of the crew members.
- 5. Notwithstanding paragraph 4 above, and provided that the CPC achieves the annual reductions in catches as required in paragraph 3, CPCs may authorize their vessels to retain onboard, transship and land North Atlantic shortfin make if one or more of the following conditions is met:
  - a) the shark is dead at haulback, and the vessel has an observer or electronic monitoring system on board to verify the condition of the shark; or
  - b) a CPC requires a minimum size of at least 180 cm fork length for males and of at least 210 cm fork length for females; or
  - c) a CPC prohibits North Atlantic shortfin make fisheries and requires that all dead fish be landed and that the fishermen shall not draw any profit from such fish.
- 6. CPCs shall report their number of dead discards and live releases of North Atlantic shortfin mako, estimated based on the total fishing effort of their relevant fleets, using data collected through observer programs or other relevant data collection programs.
- 7. CPCs should encourage the collection of biological samples, such as muscular tissues (for stock identification), reproductive organ with embryo (for identification of pregnancy cycle and reproductive output) and vertebrae (for estimation of growth curve), including through their observer programs. The biological samples collected by the observer should be analyzed by CPCs concerned and the result should be submitted to the SCRS by CPCs concerned.
- 8. To reduce North Atlantic shortfin make mortality at the vessel and post-release, CPCs shall require that vessels in their longline fisheries use nylon monofilament leaders and large circle hooks, which are fishing hooks with the point turned perpendicularly back to the shank to form a generally circular or oval shape, and the point of the hook is not offset more than 10 degrees.
- 9. CPCs shall require that owners/operators/crew of vessels flying their flag take all reasonable steps to ensure the safe release of sharks by following the Best Practices for Safe Handling and Release of Sharks contained in the Appendix to this recommendation.
- 10. In 2022, the SCRS shall review and advise on the effectiveness of the measures contained in this recommendation and, as appropriate, its predecessor (Rec. 17-08), in particular with regard to stopping overfishing and initial rebuilding progress, and also provide the Commission with additional scientific information and advice on other measures, which shall include:

- a) a spatial/temporal analysis of North Atlantic shortfin make catches in order to identify areas with high interactions;
- b) available information on growth and size at maturity by sex as well as any biologically important areas (e.g. pupping grounds); and
- the effectiveness of gear modifications as mitigation measures to reduce shortfin make shark mortality.
- 11. Taking into account the information and advice provided by SCRS pursuant to paragraph 10, the Commission shall, in 2022, review the effectiveness of this rebuilding program, in particular in achieving the objectives of paragraphs 2 and 3, and, as needed, adopt additional measures to further ensure rebuilding.
- 12. This Recommendation repeals and replaces the *Recommendation by ICCAT on the Conservation of North Atlantic Stock of Shortfin Mako Caught in Association with ICCAT Fisheries* [Rec. 17-08].

**Appendix** 

## Best Practices for the Safe Handling and Release of Sharks<sup>1</sup>

The following are best handling practices of sharks for both longline and purse seine fisheries. These best practices are appropriate for live shortfin make sharks or live individuals of other shark species to be released under no-retention policies, as well as any live sharks of any species to be released voluntarily. For all gear types, keep animals in the water.

**Safety First:** These best practices should be considered in light of safety and practicability for crew. Crew safety should always come first. Crew should wear suitable gloves and avoid working around the jaws of sharks.

#### In longline fisheries, DO:

- Release all sharks while they are still in the water.
- If possible, use a dehooker to remove the hook or cut the hook with bolt cutters. If it is not possible to remove the hook, use a long-handled line cutter to cut the gear as close to the hook as possible (ideally leaving less than 0.5 meters of line attached to the animal).

# In purse seine fisheries, DO:2

### If in purse seine net:

- Release sharks while they are still free-swimming whenever possible (e.g. back down procedure, submerging corks, cutting net)

#### If in brail or on deck:

- For sharks that are too large to be lifted safely by hand out of the brailer, it is preferable they are released using a purpose-built large-mesh cargo net or canvas sling or similar device. If the vessel layout allows, these sharks could also be released by emptying the brail directly on a ramp held up at an angle that connects to an opening on the top deck railing, without need to be lifted or handled by the crew.
- Generally, small sharks are fragile and need to be handled very carefully. If this can be done safely, it is best to handle and release them with two people, or one person using both hands.
- When entangled in netting, if safe to do so carefully cut the net away from the animal and release to the sea as quickly as possible with no netting attached.

#### In longline fisheries and purse seine fisheries, DO NOT:

- Strike a shark against any surface to remove the animal from the line.
- Attempt to dislodge a hook that is deeply ingested and not visible.
- Try to remove a hook by pulling sharply on the branchline.
- Cut the tail or any other body part.
- Cut or punch holes through the shark's body.
- Gaff or kick a shark, and do not insert hands into the gill slits.
- Wait until hauling is finished to release sharks. Release them from the gear into the water as soon as possible.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Consistent with Western and Central Pacific Fisheries Commissions (WCPFC) best handling practices, 2018. Best practices apply to sharks other than whale sharks and mantas/mobulids.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> For further information, see Annex 3 to Chapter 4 of the ICCAT Manual, *Good practices to reduce the mortality of sharks and rays caught incidentally by tropical tuna purse seiners.* 

# Additional recommendation:

Tools should be prepared in advance (e.g., canvas or net slings or stretchers for carrying or lifting, large mesh net or grid to cover hatches/hoppers in purse seine fisheries, long handled cutters and de-hookers in longline fisheries).